Charity Wibabara

Gacaca Courts versus the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda and National Courts

Lessons to Learn from the Rwandan Justice Approaches to Genocide
Schriften zum Internationalen und Europäischen Strafrecht

Edited by

Professor Dr. Martin Heger, Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin
Professor Dr. Florian Jeßberger, Universität Hamburg
Professor Dr. Frank Neubacher, M.A., Universität zu Köln
Professor Dr. Helmut Satzger, LMU München
Professor Dr. Gerhard Werle, Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin

Vol. 13
Charity Wibabara

Gacaca Courts versus the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda and National Courts

Lessons to Learn from the Rwandan Justice Approaches to Genocide

Nomos Stämpfli Verlag
This project was supported by the German Academic Exchange Service/
Deutschen Akademischen Austauschdienst (DAAD).

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the
Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data
is available in the Internet at http://dnb.d-nb.de

a.t.: Kapstadt (South Africa)/Berlin (Germany), South African-German Centre for
Transnational Criminal Justice, Faculty of Law of the University of the Western Cape
in cooperation with the Faculty of Law of Humboldt-University zu Berlin, Diss., 2013

         978-3-7272-7744-3 (Stämpfli Verlag, Bern)

ePDF   978-3-8452-5360-2

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data
A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.


Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Wibabara, Charity
Gacaca Courts versus the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda and
National Courts
Lessons to Learn from the Rwandan Justice Approaches to Genocide
Charity Wibabara
298 p.
Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN  978-3-8487-1247-2

1. Edition 2014
© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2014. Printed and bound in Germany.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be
reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical,
including photocopying, re-cording, or any information storage or retrieval system,
without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German
Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to
“Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort”, Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining
from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos
or the autor(s)/editor(s).
## Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations 13

Abstract 17

Chapter One: General Introduction of the Study 19
   A. Background of the Study 19
   B. Statement of the Problem 21
   C. Objectives of the Study 22
   D. Significance of the Study 23
   E. Methodological Approach 23
   F. Scope of the Study 24
   G. Definitions of Concepts used within the Chapters 25

Chapter Two: Historical Background to the Internecine Conflict in Rwanda 28
   A. Introduction 28
   B. Pre-Colonial Accounts of Rwandan History 29
      I. Origin of the Twa, Hutu and Tutsi 29
      II. The Relationship between Tutsi and Hutu 32
   C. The Colonial Period 36
      I. The German Colonial Rule 36
      II. The Belgian Colonial Rule 39
      III. The Fall of the Tutsi Monarchy 42
   D. Post-Colonial Period 46
      I. The First Republic 46
      II. The Second Republic 48
   E. Formation of the Rwandese Patriotic Front (RPF) 50
   F. The Genocide Period 53
Table of Contents

Chapter Three: The Legacy of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda 61
A. Introduction 61
B. Generalities about the Tribunal 63
   I. Genesis of the ICTR 63
   II. Legal Basis of the ICTR 64
   III. Organization of the Tribunal 67
   IV. Relationship between Rwanda and the Tribunal 68
C. Status of the ICTR Cases 74
D. Analysis of Important Jurisprudence before the ICTR 76
   I. Prosecutor versus Akayesu 77
   II. Prosecutor versus Kayishema 79
   III. Prosecutor versus Kambanda 81
   IV. Prosecutor versus Nahimana, Barayagwiza and Ngeze 83
   V. Prosecutor versus Ntagerura, Bagambiki, and Imanishimwe 87
   VI. Prosecutor versus Colonel Bagosora 89
   VII. Prosecutor versus Nyiramasuhuko 91
E. Achievements of the Tribunal 93
   I. Development of International Criminal Law 94
   II. Accountability for Leaders 96
   III. Creation of a Historical Record 98
F. Major Shortcomings of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda 99
   I. Delayed Justice 100
   II. Location of the ICTR 102
   III. Limited Impact on Rwanda 104

Chapter Four: Prosecution of Genocide in National Courts 107
A. Introduction 107
B. Generalities on Rwanda National Courts 108
   I. Genesis of Genocide Prosecutions 108
   II. Organisation of Ordinary Courts 109
   III. Reparations 111
C. Status of Case Law within the Ordinary Court System 112
Table of Contents

D. Analysis of the National Court Case Law
   I. Prosecutor versus Captain Twagiramungu 114
   II. Prosecution versus Private Gataza 118
   III. Prosecutor versus Corporal Gatorano 120
   IV. Prosecutor versus Major Nyirahazimana and Pasteur Ngirinshuti 124
   V. Prosecutor versus Harelimana et al. 127
   VI. Prosecutor versus Nztirabatinyi 128
   VII. Prosecutor versus Nzisabira 130
   VIII. Prosecutor versus Pandasi, Bugeri and Nzajyibwami 132
   IX. Prosecutor versus Rurangirwa, Bimenyimana, and Ntawangaheza 133
   X. Prosecutor versus Sibomana 135

E. Achievements of National Court Trials 138

F. Major Shortcomings of Domestic Prosecutions 142
   I. Congested Prisons and Insufficient Infrastructure 142
   II. Violation of Fair Trial Rights 145
      1. The Right to Speedy Trial 145
      2. The Principle of Presumption of Innocence 146
      3. The Right to Counsel of One's Choice 147

G. Excursus: Prosecution of Genocide Suspects by Third States 150
   I. Extradition Matters 150
   II. Third State Prosecutions: Case of Rwabukombe in Germany 154

Chapter Five: The Traditional Gacaca Court System 160

A. Introduction 160

B. Generalities on Grassroot Courts 161
   I. The Evolution of Gacaca Courts 162
   II. Traditional Roots of Gacaca 164
   III. Legal Basis of Gacaca Courts 167
   IV. A Standard Gacaca Trial 173

C. Status of Gacaca Case Law 175

D. Analysis of the Gacaca Case Law 176
   1. Detailed Assessment of the above 16 Case Law 180
Table of Contents

E. The Nature of Gacaca Courts: Are they Retributive or Restorative? 191
   I. Aims of Gacaca Courts 195
   II. Sentences 196
   III. Stakeholders 197
   IV. Evaluation 198
F. Achievements of Gacaca Courts 199
   I. Speedy Justice 199
   II. Reconciliatory Mechanism 201
   III. Affordable Justice 204
   IV. Enhancement of Local Transitional Justice Approaches 204
G. Shortcomings of Gacaca Courts 205
   I. Lack of Legal Representation 206
   II. Absence of Reparations 207
   III. Inadequate Protection of Witnesses 209
   IV. Corruption within the System 210
   V. Instability of Gacaca Laws 211
   VI. Non-Prosecution of all Crimes 212
   VII. Interim Remarks 214

Chapter Six: A Critical Analysis of the Relationship between the ICTR, National Courts and Gacaca Courts 216

A. Introduction 216
B. Jurisdictional Relationship 217
C. Disparities among the Different Approaches 220
   I. Right to Legal Counsel 222
   II. Right to Silence 223
   III. Right to be tried without Undue Delay 224
   IV. Jurisdiction Disparities 226
   V. Discrepancy in Sentences 228
   VI. Unequal Detention Facilities 230
D. The Contribution of Different Trials to Reconciliation 232
   I. Meaning of Reconciliation 233
   II. The ICTR, National Courts and Gacaca Contribution to Reconciliation 236
      1. Official Acknowledgement of the Crimes 236
      2. Individualization of Guilt 240
# Table of Contents

3. Truth
   a) Personal and Narrative Truth 245
   b) Factual and Forensic Truth 247
   III. Interim Conclusion 249

Chapter Seven: General Conclusions 252
   A. General Conclusions 252
   B. Overall Concluding Remarks and Optimal Approach 257

Bibliography 263