Sanita van Wyk

The Impact of Climate Change Law on the Principle of State Sovereignty over Natural Resources
Recht und Verfassung in Afrika – Law and Constitution in Africa

Herausgeber/Editorial Board:
Ulrich Karpen, Professor of Law, University of Hamburg | Hans-Peter Schneider, Professor of Law, University of Hannover | Oliver C. Ruppel, Professor of Law, University of Stellenbosch | Hartmut Hamann, Professor of Law, Freie University Berlin & Hamann Rechtsanwälte, Stuttgart

Wissenschaftlicher Beirat/Scientific Advisory Council:
Laurie Ackermann, Justice (Emeritus), Constitutional Court of South Africa, Johannesburg | Jean-Marie Breton, Professor of Law (Emeritus), Honorary Dean, University of French West Indies and Guyana | Gerhard Erasmus, Professor of Law (Emeritus), Associate, Trade Law Centre, Stellenbosch | Norbert Kersting, Professor of Political Sciences, University of Muenster | Hans Hugo Klein, RiB-VerfG a.D., Professor of Law, University of Göttingen | Salvatore Mancuso, Professor of Law, Chair Centre for Comparative Law in Africa, University of Cape Town | Yvonne Mokgoro, Justice, South African Law Reform and Development Commission, Pretoria | Lourens du Plessis, Professor of Law, Northwest University, Potchefstroom | Werner Scholtz, Professor of Law, University of the Western Cape, Bellville | Nico Steytler, Professor of Law, Int. Association of Centers for Federal Studies, Bellville | Hennie A. Strydom, Professor of Law, University of Johannesburg | Christoph Vedder, Professor of Law, University of Augsburg | Gerhard Werle, Professor of Law, Humboldt University Berlin | Johann van der Westhuizen, Justice, Constitutional Court of South Africa, Johannesburg | Reinhard Zimmermann, Professor of Law, Managing Director of the Max Planck Institute for Comparative and International Private Law, Hamburg
Sanita van Wyk

The Impact of Climate Change Law on the Principle of State Sovereignty over Natural Resources
Stellenbosch University (South Africa) grants permission for this publication and the copyright in the dissertation rests with Stellenbosch University. The research conducted in order to complete this research project was conducted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Laws in the Faculty of Law at Stellenbosch University.

This publication was produced with the support and in cooperation with the Climate Policy and Energy Security Programme for Sub-Saharan Africa of the Konrad Adenauer Stiftung. For more information on the Programme see http://www.kas.de/climate-energy-africa/en/

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the internet at http://dnb.d-nb.de

a.t.: Stellenbosch, South Africa, University, Diss., 2017

ISBN 978-3-8487-4291-2 (Print)
978-3-8452-8554-2 (ePDF)

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data
A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-4291-2 (Print)
978-3-8452-8554-2 (ePDF)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
van Wyk, Sanita
The Impact of Climate Change Law on the Principle of State Sovereignty over Natural Resources
Sanita van Wyk
373 p.
Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-8487-4291-2 (Print)
978-3-8452-8554-2 (ePDF)

1. Edition 2017

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to “Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort“, Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the author.
## Inhaltsverzeichnis

List of Abbreviations 15

CHAPTER 1: Introduction 23
1 1 Background to research question 23
1 2 Research question 26
1 3 Hypotheses 27
1 4 Research objectives and assumptions 27
1 5 Research design and methodology 28
1 6 Chapter overview 29

CHAPTER 2: The principle of sovereignty over natural resources 33
2 1 Introduction 33
2 2 Foundation of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources 33
2 3 Legal nature of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources 38
2 4 Objects of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources 46
  2 4 1 Identifying key terminology 46
  2 4 2 Natural resources 49
    2 4 2 1 Definition of natural resources 49
    2 4 2 2 Possibility of climate as a natural resource 52
    2 4 2 3 Classification of natural resources 54
      2 4 2 3 1 Classifying natural resources according to renewability and non-renewability 54
      2 4 2 3 2 Classifying natural resources according to location 55
  2 4 3 Natural wealth 60
  2 4 4 Economic activities 61
3.2 Nexus between climate change and the principle of sovereignty over natural resources

3.3 Defining the international legal climate change regime
   3.3.1 Definition of climate change
   3.3.2 Definition of regime

3.4 Scientific basis of climate change: linking activity in terms of sovereignty over natural resources with greenhouse gas emissions
   3.4.1 Link between greenhouse gas emissions and climate change
   3.4.2 Anthropocentric activity in terms of sovereignty over natural resources and the resulting increase in a specific greenhouse gas emission
      3.4.2.1 Carbon dioxide and anthropocentric activity
      3.4.2.2 Methane and anthropocentric activity
      3.4.2.3 Nitrous oxide and anthropocentric activity
      3.4.2.4 Fluorinated gases and anthropocentric activity

3.5 Illustrating the gravity of climate change in terms of its environmental, social and economic impacts on the well-being of people
   3.5.1 Introduction
   3.5.2 Understanding the term ‘well-being’
   3.5.3 Well-being of people as an objective of the international legal climate change regime and as an objective of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources
   3.5.4 Environmental effects of climate change on the well-being of people
   3.5.5 Social effects of climate change on the well-being of people
   3.5.6 Economic effects of climate change on the well-being of people

3.6 Development of the international legal climate change regime: pre-United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
   3.6.1 Introduction
Inhaltsverzeichnis

3 6 2 The emergence of climate change as an
intergovernmental issue and the international legal
climate change regime as a state-centric regime 137
3 6 3 Targets and timetables negotiations 141

3 7 The United Nations Framework Convention on Climate
Change as the cornerstone of the international legal climate
change regime and the embedding of the principle of
sovereignty over natural resources 143
3 7 1 Introduction to the United Nations Framework
Convention on Climate Change 143
3 7 2 Principles of the international legal climate change
regime 147
3 7 2 1 Principle of equity 147
3 7 2 2 Principle of common but differentiated
responsibleity 154
3 7 2 2 1 The principle 154
3 7 2 2 2 The problem with the principle of common
but differentiated responsibility as
illustrated by the example of China and the
United States of America 160
3 7 2 3 Precautionary principle 164
3 7 2 4 Polluter-pays principle 167
3 7 2 5 Principle of sustainable development 169
3 7 3 Conference of the parties 173
3 7 4 Response to climate change 180
3 7 4 1 Mitigation of climate change 180
3 7 4 1 1 Introduction 180
3 7 4 1 2 Example of a mitigation strategy: United
Nations Programme on Reducing Emissions
from Deforestation and Forest Degradation
in Developing Countries 182
3 7 4 2 Adaptation to climate change 185

3 8 The Kyoto Protocol and the effectiveness of the international
legal climate change regime 190
3 8 1 Introduction 190
3 8 2 Market-based mechanisms of the Kyoto Protocol 191
3 8 2 1 Introduction to international emissions trading 191
3 8 2 2 Joint implementation mechanism 194
Clean development mechanism 196
Registry of Kyoto units acquired through market-based mechanisms 198
Effectiveness of the Kyoto Protocol 199
Overall effectiveness of the Kyoto Protocol and the possible movement towards a people-based solution 199
Reporting as a component of an effective international legal climate change regime 201
State compliance as a component of an effective international legal climate change regime 204
Compliance provisions in the Kyoto Protocol and the inadequate repercussions of non-compliance 204
Increasing compliance with the Kyoto Protocol and the principle of sovereignty over natural resources as a negative incentive 206
The Paris Agreement 210
Introduction 210
Outline of differentiation between countries and nationally determined contributions in the Paris Agreement 211
Market-based mechanism of the Paris Agreement 214
Future outlook on the effectiveness of the Paris Agreement and the position of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources 216
Conclusion 220

CHAPTER 4: The reinterpretation and reconfiguration of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources and the expansion of the means to combat climate change 223

Introduction 223
Rights and duties of states in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources and the impact of climate change

4.2.1 Introduction to the rights and duties of states in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources

4.2.2 Rights of states in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources and the impact of climate change

4.2.2.1 Right to dispose freely of, explore, and exploit natural resources

4.2.2.2 Right to exercise effective control over natural resources and the right to receive appropriate compensation

4.2.2.3 Right to use natural resources for national development

4.2.2.4 Right to manage natural resources according to national environmental policy

4.2.2.5 Right to an equitable share in benefits of transboundary natural resources

4.2.2.6 Rights pertaining to foreign investment

4.2.2.6.1 Introduction to and delineation of rights (and duties) pertaining to foreign investment

4.2.2.6.2 Rights pertaining to the regulation and exercise of authority over foreign investment

4.2.2.6.3 Rights pertaining to the taking of property and the payment of compensation

4.2.2.6.4 Possible right pertaining to the settlement of disputes on the basis of national law

4.2.3 Duties of states in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources and the impact of climate change

4.2.3.1 Duty to exercise sovereignty over natural resources for national development and the well-being of people

4.2.3.2 Duty to cooperate in respect of international development

4.2.3.3 Duty of conservation and sustainable use of natural resources
### Inhaltsverzeichnis

<p>| 4.2.3.4 | Duty to share transboundary natural resources equitably | 274 |
| 4.2.3.5 | Duty to respect international law | 279 |
| 4.2.4 | Final remarks on the rights and duties of states in terms of sovereignty over natural resources, and the shift in environmental attitudes owing to the effects of climate change | 281 |
| 4.2.5 | Increased importance of the common concern as an indicator of the growing importance of the duties of states in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources | 284 |
| 4.3 | Reinterpreting and reconfiguring the rights of people in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources | 289 |
| 4.3.1 | Introduction | 289 |
| 4.3.2 | People’s rights in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources | 292 |
| 4.3.2.1 | Introduction to people’s rights in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources | 292 |
| 4.3.2.2 | Right to economic self-determination | 293 |
| 4.3.2.3 | Human rights and the right to economic self-determination | 302 |
| 4.3.3 | Application of the right to economic self-determination | 305 |
| 4.3.3.1 | Introduction | 305 |
| 4.3.3.2 | Application of economic self-determination by indigenous people | 306 |
| 4.3.3.3 | Growing possibilities of the application of economic self-determination in the context of foreign investment | 317 |
| 4.4 | Expanding the means to combat climate change through people’s rights in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources | 320 |
| 4.4.1 | Introduction and initial steps for people-based action in holding states accountable for climate commitments | 320 |
| 4.4.2 | People-based action against the state in terms of the Oslo Principles on Global Climate Change | 323 |
| 4.4.3 | Urgenda case and general movement toward people-based climate change litigation | 328 |
| 4.5 | Conclusion | 337 |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 5: Conclusion</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Remarks on the original research objectives and hypotheses</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Areas of future research</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Chapter summaries and outline of research outcomes</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.1 Chapter 2: The principle of sovereignty over natural resources</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.2 Chapter 3: The international legal climate change regime and the question of whether the gravity of climate change warrants a reinterpretation and reconfiguration of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources</td>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.3 Chapter 4: The reinterpretation and reconfiguration of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources and the expansion of the means to combat climate change</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 Recommendations</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case law</td>
<td>370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International instruments and legislation</td>
<td>371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seminars, lectures and presentations</td>
<td>374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNGA resolutions and other resolutions or decisions</td>
<td>374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online media</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>