The book comprises seven interconnected essays that aim to enrich our understanding of Mill’s thinking and his political liberalism as a historically determined narrative. It does so by drawing on recent historiographical debates, the theoretical assumptions of the “New History of Political Thought” and conceptual history. Sharing a common methodological ground, the different chapters elaborate on questions concerning the relevance of historical texts for our present understanding of Mill’s thought and how to study them as embedded in their social and political context. Thus, the book examines a variety of textual sources, gravitating around the study of a selection of concepts and a number of prominent intellectuals, which contributes to portray Mill’s intellectual milieu and historical background.

Rosario López is a Postdoctoral Research Fellow at the Department of Philosophy, University of Málaga (Spain).
Scientific Advisory Board:
Alan Finlayson (East Anglia, UK)
Olivia Guaraldo (Verona, Italy)
Irène Herrmann (Genève, Switzerland)
José María Rosales (Málaga, Spain)
Quentin Skinner (Queen Mary, London, UK)
Patricia Springborg (Bolzano, Italy, and Berlin, Germany)
Willibald Steinmetz (Bielefeld, Germany)
Nadia Urbinati (New York, USA)
Ole Waever (Kopenhagen, Denmark)

Politics-Debates-Concepts
Politik-Debatten-Begriffe

Edited by
PD Dr. Claudia Wiesner
Prof. Dr. Kari Palonen

Volume 4
Rosario López

Contexts of John Stuart Mill’s Liberalism

Politics and the Science of Society in Victorian Britain

Nomos
Table of Contents

1. Introduction: Approaching John Stuart Mill’s Political Thought 13
   1.1 Purpose of the Study 13
   1.2 The Argument 15
   1.3 Mill in Context: The Approach 21
   1.4 Debates on Method: The Study of the History of Political Thought 26

2. ‘The Collision of Adverse Opinions’: The Many Faces of Antagonism 31
   2.1 Antagonistic Forces in the History of Modern Civilisation: Guizot and Coleridge 32
   2.2 The Place of Dissenters in On Liberty 35
   2.3 Developing a Method: The Science of Society, Political Economy and Political Science 38
   2.4 Hearing Both Sides of the Subject: Mill’s Personal Experience of Antagonism and his Intellectual Development 39
   2.5 Parliament and the Value of Debate 42
   2.6 Concluding Remarks 47

3. History, Progress, and the Study of Society 49
   3.1 History as the ‘Great Things’ Achieved by Mankind 49
   3.2 Mill and the Coleridgeans on History 50
   3.3 France and French Historians 53
   3.4 Concluding Remarks 57

4. The Principles of Order and Progress in Mill’s Social and Political Thought 61
   4.1 Coleridge (1840) 62
   4.2 A System of Logic (1843) and The Principles of Political Economy (1848) 66
   4.3 Guizot’s Essays and Lectures on History (1845) 71
# Table of Contents

4.4 *On Liberty* (1859) and *Thoughts on Parliamentary Reform* (1859) 73  
4.5 *Considerations on Representative Government* (1861) 75  
4.6 *Auguste Comte and Positivism* (1865) and *Inaugural Address Delivered to the University of St. Andrews* (1867) 76  
4.7 Concluding Remarks 78

5. The Argumentative Usages of Order and Progress: Social and Political Debates in Newspapers, Pamphlets and the Writings of Victorian Intellectuals (c. 1840-1899) 81  
5.1 Intellectuals’ Arguments 83  
5.1.1 Samuel Taylor Coleridge and John Stuart Mill 83  
5.1.2 Herbert Spencer (1820-1903) 83  
5.1.3 Auguste Comte’s Positivism, Frederic Harrison and Samuel Alexander 85  
5.1.4 Walter Bagehot (1836-1877) 86  
5.1.5 Political Ideologies Encapsulated 90  
5.2 Exploring Everyday Language: Newspaper Articles 93  
5.2.1 Explaining Social and Political Unrest 94  
5.2.2 Summarising Ideological Positions 100  
5.3 Exploring Everyday Language: Pamphlets 104  
5.4 Concluding Remarks 106

6.1 What is it to be Interpreted? On Multiple Versions of Political Texts 107  
6.2 The Peculiarities of Mill’s *A System of Logic* 110  
6.3 The Relevance of Textual Instability for Understanding Authorial Revisions 113  
6.4 Mill’s Revision Process: Recasting Comte’s Role in *A System of Logic* 115  
6.5 Concluding Remarks 122

7. Natural Imagery and Metaphors in Mill’s Science of Society 129  
7.1 Metaphors and Natural Images in *A System of Logic* 130  
7.1.1 Social Organism, Social Body and Body Politic 131
## Table of Contents

7.1.2 Consensus ........................................... 135  
7.1.3 Statics and Dynamics ................................. 137  
7.1.4 Astronomy and the Progress of History ................. 140  
7.1.5 Cohesion and Mathematics .......................... 142  
7.2 Contemporary Debates on the Relevance of Metaphors:  
Interpretive Insights into the Logic ......................... 145  
7.2.1 The Task of Understanding Mill’s Use of  
Figurative Language .................................... 145  
7.2.2 The Controversies on the Cognitive Value  
of Metaphors ............................................ 147  
7.3 Concluding Remarks ..................................... 151  
8. Mill’s Concept of Nationality: Enriching Contemporary  
Interpretations through Contextual History ............... 153  
8.1 Present-day Interpretations of Mill’s Concept of  
Nationality and Considerations on Representative  
Government .............................................. 154  
8.2 Reshaping Mill’s Concept of Nationality:  
A System of Logic ....................................... 159  
8.2.1 The ‘Vulgar Sense’ of Nationality: Recasting its  
Meaning as a Principle of Cohesion ..................... 160  
8.2.2 Textual Revision and Quentin Skinner’s  
Insights .................................................. 163  
8.2.3 The Meaning of ‘Cohesion’ and the Argumentative  
Context .................................................. 165  
8.3 Concluding Remarks ..................................... 168  
9. Conclusions ................................................. 171  
Note on chapters ............................................ 179  
Bibliography ................................................. 181