

Bogdana Depo

Goliath versus Goliath

EU Democracy Promotion in the Eastern Neighbourhood
and Russia's Alternative Agenda



Nomos

Studies on the European Union

Series Editor:

Wolfgang Wessels

Jean Monnet Chair *ad personam* for Political Science

CETEUS | Centre for Turkey and European Union Studies

University of Cologne

Volume 15

Bogdana Depo

Goliath versus Goliath

EU Democracy Promotion in the Eastern Neighbourhood
and Russia's Alternative Agenda



Nomos



Financed by Robert Schuman Foundation, Luxembourg.

This publication reflects the views only of the author.

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Cologne, Univ., Diss., 2018

ISBN 978-3-8487-5870-8 (Print)
978-3-7489-0003-0 (ePDF)

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-5870-8 (Print)
978-3-7489-0003-0 (ePDF)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Depo, Bogdana

Goliath versus Goliath

EU Democracy Promotion in the Eastern Neighbourhood and

Russia's Alternative Agenda

Bogdana Depo

283 pp.

Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-8487-5870-8 (Print)
978-3-7489-0003-0 (ePDF)

1st Edition 2019

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2019. Printed and bound in Germany.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to "Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort", Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the author.

Acknowledgements

To Prof. Wolfgang Wessels and Prof. Lenka Rovná, who gave me the unique chance to be a part of the prestigious Marie Curie Programme and who were supportive of me on the path to PhD.

To my Mom, Liliia Depo, and to my Sister, who provided me with the best upbringing possible, lots of love and care, and who continue to support me with life guidance and wisdom.

To my father, Prof. Bogdan Depo, who would be happy for me.

To Sandra Kalniete and Andrej Plenković, who are the leading democracy promoters in the EU and who are politicians to praise, to follow and to admire.

To Michael Gahler for his support of my application form for the Robert Schuman Foundation funding of this book.

To Giselle Bosse and Philippe Perchoc, who believed in me, and who were a source of inspiration and of unwavering academic support.

To my friends, Nóirín Ní Earcáin, Arthur Le Ber, Daniela McFarren, Thomas Vanhauwaert, Dominika Tondera, James Nyomakwa-Obimpeh, Aga Horak, Bożena Marciniak and many others who were always by my side.

To Archbishop Yevstratiy, with gratitude for his spiritual guidance.

Table of Contents

Introduction	13
Abbreviations	15
CHAPTER 1: Democracy Promotion: the Evolution of the EU Foreign Policy Tool and of Research Avenues	17
1.1 The Definition and Evolution of EU Democracy Promotion	17
1.1.1 Definition of Democracy Promotion	18
1.1.2 1990-2004: Democratization of the Western NIS	19
1.1.3 Pre-accession Process – an Instrument of Democratization	21
1.1.4 2004 Enlargement: an Attempt to Duplicate the Success with New Eastern Neighbours	22
1.1.5 2009: Launching the Eastern Partnership	25
1.1.6 2011 ENP Review	26
1.1.7 2015 ENP Review	27
1.2 Literature Review: Waves of Research of EU Democracy Promotion with regard to the Eastern Neighbourhood	28
1.2.1 2003-2005: 'Coloured Revolutions' and Internal Post-Soviet Transformations	28
1.2.2 2004: Launching the ENP	30
1.2.3 2010-2011: The Arab Spring: Democracy versus Stability Dilemma	32
1.2.4 2014: EuroMaidan as a Game-changer	33
1.2.5 In Search of a New Research Avenue	34
CHAPTER 2: Theoretical Puzzle and Methodology	35
2.1 Liberal Democracy by Francis Fukuyama	35
2.2 Putting Fukuyama's Predictions to the Test	38
2.2.1 Testing Democratization in the Neighbourhood	38
2.2.2 Fukuyama's Prediction of No Competition to the Liberal Agenda	40
2.3 Democracy Promotion as a Threat to Strategic Interests	42
2.3.1 Russia as an Autocracy Promoter	44

Table of Contents

2.3.2 Assumption: Autocracy Versus Democracy Promoter	45
2.3.3 Any Alternative Assumptions?	48
2.4 The Balance of Power Thesis	49
2.5 Identifying the Balance between Democracy Promoter and Autocracy Promoter	50
2.5.1 Step 1: Identifying Balancing through Categories	50
2.5.2 Step 2: Historical Overview of Balancing	55
2.6 Methodological Tools	57
2.6.1 Case Studies – a Regional Approach	57
2.6.2 Qualitative Content Analysis	58
2.6.3 Political Discourse Analysis	59
2.6.4 Exploratory Interviews	60
2.6.5 Structure of the book	60
CHAPTER 3: 1991 – 1997: The EU’s First Steps in Democracy Promotion and Russia’s Military Boots in the Shared Neighbourhood	62
3.1 EU-Russia Relations: Anticipated Beginning of the Common Path towards Liberal Democracy	62
3.2 EU’s Arrival in the Eastern Neighbourhood (1991-1997)	64
3.2.1 The Normative Dimension: Introduction of the Region to Democracy	65
3.2.2 The Economic Dimension: Introducing the Market Economy	66
3.2.3 The Security Dimension: or ‘The Absence Thereof’	67
3.3 Russia’s Policy towards the Post-Soviet States in the 90s: Keeping the Post-Soviet Space on Puppet Strings and the EU in Tension (1990 – 1997)	69
3.3.1 The Normative Dimension: Reinforcing the ‘Inseparable’ Bond of the Soviet past	70
3.3.2 The Economic Dimension: Re-/Dis-integrating Post-Soviet Space	71
3.3.3 The Security Dimension: the Military Bond is Stronger than Social Ties	74

CHAPTER 4: 1998-2003: The Growing Divide between the EU and Russia over the Shared Neighbourhood	80
4.1 EU-Russia Relations: from Cooperation to Conflict	81
4.2 EU: from Limited Cooperation to 'Everything but Institutions'	85
4.2.1 The Normative Dimension: Democratic Values as the Base of Bilateral Relations	85
4.2.2 The Economic Dimension: from Donor to Partner	87
4.2.3 The Security Dimension: New Instruments in Addressing the Security Issues	88
4.3 Russia: Rethinking the Strategy towards the CIS	90
4.3.1 The Normative Dimension: Coining the Term 'Compatriots'	92
4.3.2 The Economic Dimension: Held Back by the 'Ruble Crisis'	93
4.3.3 The Security Dimension: 'As NATO Grows, so do Russia's Worries'	94
CHAPTER 5: 2004-2008: The EU's and Russia's Assertiveness and Collision of Agendas	98
5.1 EU-Russia Relations: the Strategic Partnership	99
5.1.1 EU-Russia Relations: from Russia as a 'Wider Europe' to Russia as a Strategic Partner	100
5.1.2 Friction over the Shared Neighbourhood	101
5.1.3 By 2008 – a New Level of EU-Russia Cooperation	103
5.2 EU: More Assertiveness and Strategy	104
5.2.1 The Normative Dimension: Cooperation Based on Common and Shared Values	106
5.2.2 The Economic Dimension: More Programmes and Pre-Accession Instruments	108
5.2.3 The Security Dimension: Stability, Security and Well-Being	109
5.3 Russia: an Era of Undeclared Wars against the Shared Neighbourhood	111
5.3.1 The Normative Dimension: through Passportization to 'Russkiy Mir'	114
5.3.2 The Economic Dimension: Fading Economic Influence	117

Table of Contents

5.3.3	The Security Dimension: Three War Fronts of Russia towards the Shared Neighbourhood	118
5.3.3.a	War Stage 1: The 2006 Economic Blockade against Georgia and Moldova	119
5.3.3.b	War Stage 2: Energy Wars	121
5.3.3.c	WAR 3: 2008 August War in Georgia	128
CHAPTER 6: 2009-2016: The EU's New Approach towards the Eastern Neighbourhood – the Eastern Partnership		136
6.1	Geopolitical Context	136
6.2	The Aim of the Eastern Partnership	138
6.2.1	Multilateral Track	138
6.2.2	The Bilateral Track	147
6.3	Financial Support for Liberal Democracies in the Eastern Partnership – Support for the Introduction of Association Agreements	154
6.4	Involvement of other International Financial Institutions	154
6.5	The EU's Vision of Russia's Involvement	155
CHAPTER 7: 2009-2016: Russia Versus the EU's Enhanced Democratization		157
7.1	Russia's Vision of the Eastern Partnership	157
7.2	Russia's Alternative Projects to the Eastern Partnership	160
7.3	Paradox: Inspired by the Soviet Union and Built on the EU's Experience	162
7.3.1	Soviet Legacy as a Foundation for Reintegration	163
7.3.2	The EU's Institutional Set-Up as a Blueprint	164
7.4	Russia's Offer of Equal Cooperation or Imperial Overstretch?	166
7.4.1	The Normative Dimension: Reuniting the 'Russian World' by any Means	166
7.4.2	The Economic Dimension: Doubtful Economic Interest behind the Eurasian Economic Union	170
7.4.3	The Security Dimension	172
7.5	Interpretation of the EU's Actions by Russian leadership	176
7.5.1	The Normative Dimension: Democratic Values as Western 'Messianism'	176

7.5.2	The Economic Dimension: the EU's Offer of Economic Integration as Incompatible with Russia's Projects	178
7.5.3	The Security Dimension: EU's Security by Means of NATO's Expansion to the East as a Threat to Russia	180
CHAPTER 8: Russia's Strategy for the Destruction of the EaP		183
8.1	Armenia	183
8.1.1	Dangerous U-Turn	186
8.1.2	EU-Armenian Relations after the U-Turn	187
8.2	Azerbaijan	188
8.3	Belarus	190
8.3.1	Paralyzing Belarus' Independence through Deep Integration	190
8.3.2	Rewarded for Loyalty, Punished for Independent Actions	192
8.4	Georgia	193
8.4.1	'Break-Away Regions' as the Sword of Damocles over Tbilisi	193
8.4.2	Hitting Georgia's Strategic Infrastructure	196
8.4.3	Russia's Economic Instruments	198
8.5	Moldova	199
8.5.1	First Threats – Then Economic Embargo	199
8.5.2	Moldovan Transnistria: Security and Energy Threats	201
8.5.3	Pressure on Workers	202
8.5.4	EU's Support to Moldova	203
8.6	Ukraine	204
8.6.1	A Gas Deal in Exchange for the Black Sea Fleet	204
8.6.2	Prior to the Association Agreement: Gifts, Threats and Sanctions	205
8.6.3	The Russia's Strategy after Ukraine's Revolution: Fighting Back for its Influence	207
8.6.4	Russia's Narratives: Fight for the Future with Ukraine and Against the EU's Negative Influence	211
8.6.5	EU's Attempts to Save Democracy in Ukraine	213
Conclusions		225
Bibliography		233

