

Aline Bartenstein

The Concept of Solidarity

Energy Policy in the European Union



Nomos

Studies on the European Union

Series Editor:

Wolfgang Wessels

Jean Monnet Chair *ad personam* for Political Science
CETEUS | Centre for Turkey and European Union Studies
University of Cologne

Volume 18

Aline Bartenstein

The Concept of Solidarity

Energy Policy in the European Union



Nomos

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Köln, Univ., Diss., 2021

ISBN 978-3-8487-8419-6 (Print)
978-3-7489-2795-2 (ePDF)

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-8419-6 (Print)
978-3-7489-2795-2 (ePDF)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Bartenstein, Aline
The Concept of Solidarity
Energy Policy in the European Union
Aline Bartenstein
318 pp.
Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-8487-8419-6 (Print)
978-3-7489-2795-2 (ePDF)



Onlineversion
Nomos eLibrary

1st Edition 2021

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2021. Overall responsibility for manufacturing (printing and production) lies with Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to "Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort", Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the author.

Acknowledgments

When I drafted the first ideas of my thesis in 2017, I was far from imagining how this rambling path will develop over time. In 2020, – when the Covid-19 health crisis hit hard – I wondered if it was possible to complete the thesis without childcare, without or only limited access to libraries and without the possibility to meet in person with my supervisors.

Writing the thesis was certainly an eventful journey which only succeeded thanks to the different fellow travellers who accompanied me. I would like to thank my supervisors Prof. *Wolfgang Wessels* und Prof. *André Kaiser* who have both encouraged my work and research angle.

I thank also my colleagues at the Jean Monnet Chair and at CETEUS at the University of Cologne who provided the opportunity to discuss my research in an inspiring and challenging environment. Even more important was the friendly and humorous atmosphere. My thanks go in particular to Dr. *Claudia Heffler*, Dr. *Andreas Raspotnik* and *Leonie Völker*.

I am very grateful to have had the moral support of a group of exceptional and brilliant women who share the pleasure and burden of having kids in the academic world. I want to thank *Mirjam Dickmeis*, Dr. *Ursula Gießmann* and Dr. *Nicole Hiekel*. *Heidi Fritze*, Dr. *Friederike Strack* und *Susanne Wolfmaier* have been great friends during this time! Thank you so much for your precious help.

But who am I without my family? Merci, *Thierry Albrecht*, for all your understanding and support. You always reminded me of my strength and motivated me in difficult times. *Louise* and *Emile*, you brought me back down to earth, when I was lost in thought. There is nothing more rewarding than exploring the world together with you.

Thank you, dear sisters, *Julia Bartenstein*, *Hanna Gallus* and *Liane Leske*, for always being there when I need you. Mein größter Dank geht aber an meine Eltern *Birgit und Otto Bartenstein*. Ihr habt mich immer darin bestärkt meinen eigenen Weg zu gehen, mutig zu sein und das Leben selbst in die Hand zu nehmen.

Köln, July 2021

Aline Bartenstein

Table of Contents

List of Figures	11
List of Boxes	13
List of Abbreviations	15
1. Introduction: European solidarity – a chameleonic term	17
1.1. Research interest	21
1.2. Research question	25
1.3. Research design	28
1.4. Outline of the book	29
2. Research framework	32
2.1. Concept formation	32
2.1.1. The evolution of solidarity over time: reflections of the pioneers	35
2.1.2. Sources of solidarity	41
2.1.3. Delineation of solidarity from neighbouring terms	55
2.1.4. Analysis of the features of solidarity	60
2.1.5. Concept formation of solidarity between Member States	72
2.1.6. Definition and concept of solidarity	86
2.1.7. Results	89
2.2. Theoretical framework	90
2.2.1. Drivers for solidarity explained by neofunctionalism	90
2.2.2. Variables and Hypotheses	96
2.2.3. Operationalisation of variables	99
2.3. Methodological framework	105
2.3.1. Case Selection and Analysis	105
2.3.2. Data Collection and Analysis	111

Table of Contents

3. The principle of solidarity as political commitment and legal norm	118
3.1. Solidarity is running through the EU's bloodlines	118
3.1.1. From Maastricht to Nice: inclusion of solidarity as a legal principle	121
3.1.2. The new impetus by the Treaty of Lisbon	122
3.1.3. Solidarity as legal norm and binding commitment	126
3.1.4. European energy policy and the effects of solidarity as a legal principle	128
3.2. The different stages of European energy policy	132
3.2.1. Phase I: Energy policy under pressure to reform (2005 – 2008)	133
3.2.2. Phase II: Changing old patterns (2009 – 2013)	143
3.2.3. Phase III: The Energy Union (as of 2014)	148
3.2.4. Results and discussion	152
4. Solidarity in secondary law: only cosmetic improvements?	154
4.1. Case 1: SoS – solidarity in case of emergency	156
4.1.1. Times of crisis – solidarity in crisis	161
4.1.2. The stony way to Regulation 2017/1938	181
4.1.3. Results and discussion	200
4.2. Case 2: The integration of the gas market: the pursuit of solidarity	204
4.2.1. Regional solidarity as answer to the gas crisis	204
4.2.2. Results and discussion	209
4.2.3. Lex Nord Stream 2	211
4.3. Case 3: Intergovernmental agreements under European scrutiny	213
4.3.1. Decision (EU)2012/994: solidarity should guide our actions	214
4.3.2. Solidarity? We are not so sure about it: Decision (EU) 2017/684	219
4.3.3. Results and discussion	224
4.4. Case 4: Making solidarity work: investments in infrastructure	226
4.4.1. The TEN-E Regulation: Did pipe dreams come true?	229
4.4.2. Results and discussion	236

Table of Contents

4.5. The Court Case: Speaking with one voice? Nord Stream 1 as solidarity quest	237
4.5.1. The development of Nord Stream 1	238
4.5.2. The OPAL Case T-883/16 and Case C-848/19 P	243
4.5.3. Results and discussion	248
5. Conclusions	251
5.1. Theoretical reflections on solidarity	252
5.2. Synopsis of work: synthesis of findings	259
5.3. The solidarity concept and further research avenues	268
List of Literature	273
Annex	309
Annex 1: Definitions of Solidarity	309
Annex 2: Code Book – Concept of Solidarity	313
Annex 3: List of interviews and personal communications	315
Annex 4: Major policy trends in energy policy with a focus on solidarity	316

List of Figures

Figure 1: Values in European Council Conclusions 2004–2019	19
Figure 2: References to solidarity in European Council conclusions	27
Figure 3: Causal mechanism – functional spillover	110
Figure 4: Causal mechanism – cultivated spillover	111
Figure 5: Frames in Commission Communication on Security of Supply 2002	157
Figure 6: European Parliament Debate on Security of Gas Supply 2010	178
Figure 7: Framing of solidarity by Commission	192
Figure 8: Frames used by European Parliament	260
Figure 9: Frames used by Commission	263

List of Boxes

Box 1:	The Solidarity Discourse	17
Box 2:	Research Questions	25
Box 3:	Conceptualisation	34
Box 4:	Solidarity actors	65
Box 5:	Forms of solidarity	67
Box 6:	Ensuring Solidarity	71
Box 7:	Solidarity actors on the EU level	76
Box 8:	Forms of solidarity between EU Member States	81
Box 9:	Ensuring solidarity between EU Member States	85
Box 10:	Definition of solidarity between EU Member States	86
Box 11:	Features of solidarity	87
Box 12:	Legislation on gas policy containing references to solidarity	107
Box 13:	Examples of interview questions	117
Box 14:	Gas crisis 2006	134
Box 15:	Presentation of variance of solidarity	155
Box 16:	Solidarity features named by the Commission	184

List of Abbreviations

ACER	Agency for the Cooperation of Energy Regulators
AFET	Committee on Foreign Affairs
ALDE	Alliance of Liberals and Democrats for Europe
BNetzA	Bundesnetzagentur
CEAS	Common European Asylum System
CFSP	Common Foreign and Security Policy
CJEU / ECJ	Court of Justice of the European Union
COM	European Commission
Council	Council of the European Union
DG	Directorates-General
DV	Dependent Variable
ECON	Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs
EEAS	European External Action Service
ENTSOG	European Network of Transmission System Operators for Gas
EP	European Parliament
EPE	Energy Policy for Europe
EPP/PPE	European People's Party
EU	European Union
EUCO	European Council
GCCG	Gas Coordination Group
HR	High Representative of the Union for Foreign Affairs and Security Policy
IA	Impact Assessment
IEA	International Energy Agency
IGA	Intergovernmental Agreement
INI	Own-initiative procedure
ITRE	Committee on Industry, Research and Energy
IV	Independent Variable
LNG	Liquefied Natural Gas
MEP	Member of European Parliament
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NEL	Nordeuropäische Erdgasleitung
NS	Nord Stream
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OPAL	Ostsee-Pipeline-Anbindungsleitung
PCI	Project of Common Interest
PEES Act	Protecting Europe's Energy Security Act
PSE	Party of European Socialists
PT	Process Tracing

List of Abbreviations

RC	Rational Choice
RQ	Research Question
SEA	Single European Act
SoS	Security of Supply
TEN-E	Trans-European Networks for Energy
TEU	Treaty on the European Union
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
TPA	Third-Party Access
TSO	Transmission System Operator
UEN	Union for Europe of the Nations
UK	United Kingdom
Verts/ALE	The Greens/European Free Alliance
WP	Working Party (Council)