The Notion of Secrecy

A Balanced Approach in the Light of the Trade Secrets Directive
MIPLC Studies
Edited by
Prof. Dr. Christoph Ann, LL.M. (Duke Univ.)
TUM School of Management
Prof. Robert Brauneis
The George Washington University Law School
Prof. Dr. Josef Drexl, LL.M. (Berkeley)
Max Planck Institute for Innovation and Competition
Prof. Dr. Michael Kort
University of Augsburg
Prof. Dr. Thomas M.J. Möllers
University of Augsburg
Prof. Dr. Dres. h.c. Joseph Straus
Max Planck Institute for Innovation and Competition

Volume 39
Teresa Trallero Ocaña

The Notion of Secrecy

A Balanced Approach in the Light of the Trade Secrets Directive
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisor Professor Annette Kur for her support during the completion of the dissertation and her valuable academic guidance. I would also like to express my gratitude to Professor Ansgar Ohly for providing the Zweitgutachten.

After graduating from the Munich Intellectual Property Law Center (MIPLC), I was fortunate to be accepted as a doctoral student by the Max Planck Institute for Innovation and Competition, to which I owe not only the financial support, but also the possibility of conducting research in the most stimulating academic environment.

I am particularly grateful to Seth Ericsson, Margit Hinkel and Ulrike Stubenvoll for their support throughout this long journey and making the MIPLC my family far away from home.

I would not have been able to complete this work without the support of so many friends and colleagues, but among them I would especially like to mention my good friend Marisa for her constant encouragement.

Special thanks go to Fabian for everything.

Most importantly, I would like to thank my mother Maite, my sister Anna, and my grandparents Manuel and María Teresa. This dissertation is dedicated to them.
Table of Contents

Abbreviations

Introduction

§ 1 Object, scope and structure of the research 25
§ 2 Research methodology 27

Chapter 1. Concept, justifications and legal nature of trade secrets 29
§ 1 The significance and concept of trade secrets 29
§ 2 The problematic justifications underlying trade secrets protection
   A) Deontological arguments 33
      I. Commercial ethics 33
      II. Labour value theory 34
      III. Contractarian theory 35
   B) Utilitarian arguments 36
      I. Incentives to innovate 36
      II. Incentives to disclose 41
      III. Limit to the arms race 43
      IV. The privacy rationale 45
   C) Conclusion on the doctrines underlying trade secrets protection 48

§ 3 Dissecting the legal nature of trade secrets: between IPRs and unfair competition 49
   A) The unsettled relationship between trade secrets and IPRs 51
      I. Trade secrets and patents 51
         1. Trade secrets prior to patenting 52
         2. Preferring trade secrets over patents 55
            a) Analysis of economical empirical evidence 55
            b) Advantages of secrets over patents 59
            c) The risks of secrecy 65
         3. Simultaneous protection of trade secrets and patents 69
      II. Trade secrets and copyright 71
      III. Trade secrets and trade marks 74
Table of Contents

IV. Trade secrets and the database right: the protection of investment as such 77
1. The EU two-tier legal regime for the protection of databases and its interplay with trade secrets protection 77
2. The problem of protecting created data under the sui generis database right and the possibility of resorting to contractual protection 82
V. Conclusion on the relationship between trade secrets and IPRs 87
B) Trade secrets as the object of intellectual property law: considerations for Europe 87
I. Comparative legal analysis 89
1. International intellectual property convention system 89
2. Common law approach 93
a) England 93
b) U.S. 96
3. Civil law approach 100
a) Italy 100
b) Germany 101
4. European Union approach 104
II. Considering information as the object of property rights 107
1. Preliminary remarks: the problematic conceptualisation of information as such as the object of IPRs 107
2. The debate in the U.S.: INS v. Associated Press and its influential dissent 110
3. Semiotics approach to the property debate 113
4. Example case: data producer’s right 115
5. Concluding remarks on the treatment of information as property 119
III. Dissecting the proprietary debate in the light of the harmonised framework created by the TSD 121
§ 4 Conclusion 126
Chapter 2. Trade secrets protection in the international context 129

§ 1 International legal sources for the protection of undisclosed information 129

A) International minimum standards of protection: The TRIPs Agreement and the protection of undisclosed information 130

I. General framework 130

II. Negotiation history of Article 39 TRIPs 132

III. The architecture of the general obligation to protect undisclosed information: Article 39(1)TRIPs 135

1. Hybrid nature of the protection 135

2. Construing Article 10bis PC in the context of undisclosed information 136

IV. Article 39(2) TRIPs 141

1. Scope of the obligation 141

2. Requirements for protection 144

a) Information 144

b) Secrecy: Information not generally known or readily accessible 146

c) Commercial value 147

d) Reasonable steps to maintain secrecy 149

B) Considerations from a soft law perspective: The WIPO Model Provisions on the protection of unfair competition 150

§ 2 Trade secrets protection in the U.S. 151

A) Evolution of trade secret law in the U.S.: main legislative sources 152

B) Definition of a trade secret and requirements for protection in the U.S. 158

I. Definitional aspects 158

II. Requirements for protection 164

1. Secrecy: information not generally known or readily ascertainable 164

2. Independent economic value 168

3. Reasonable measures to maintain secrecy 171

a) Assessment of the “reasonableness” of the measures adopted 172

b) Criticism 174

C) The legal regime for the protection of trade secrets under the UTSA, the DTSA and the Restatements of the law 177

§ 3 Conclusion 181
Table of Contents

Chapter 3. Fragmented protection of trade secrets across the EU leading to a harmonised system: study of the English and German models and the emerging common framework 182

§ 1 Scattered protection across the internal market before the implementation of the Trade Secrets Directive: Different models 182

§ 2 Trade secrets protection in Germany before the implementation of the TSD 184
   A) Development of the law of trade secrets 185
   B) Legal regime for the protection of trade secrets 186
      I. Constitutional Law 186
      II. Unfair competition law and its intersection with criminal law 187
         1. § 17 UWG Trade secrets disclosure 189
            a) Unauthorised trade secret disclosure in the course of employment 190
            b) Industrial espionage 193
            c) General prohibition 195
         2. § 18 UWG Use of models 196
   III. Civil law 198
      1. Criminal accessory claims 199
      2. Civil autonomous claims 201

§ 3 Trade Secrets Protection in England before the implementation of the TSD – The law of confidentiality 202
   A) A note on Brexit 204
   B) Development of the law of confidentiality 205
   C) Legal regime for the protection of confidential information under the breach of confidence action 206
      I. Jurisdictional basis for the action 206
         1. Contract 207
         2. Equity 208
         3. Property 209
         4. Tort 210
      II. Liability requirements 212
         1. The quality of confidence 214
         2. The obligation of confidence 215
            a) Disclosure by confider to confidant 215
            b) Accidental acquisition 218
            c) Surreptitious acquisition 219
            d) Third party liability 220
Table of Contents

3. Unauthorised use 224
   III. The “springboard doctrine” 226
§ 4 Concluding remarks on the comparative law analysis 228

§ 5 The emerging common framework: a critical study of the Trade Secrets Directive 229
   A) Background of the Directive 229
   B) Legal basis and grounds for harmonising trade secrets protection 233
   C) Legal analysis of the TSD 237
      I. General remarks 238
      II. Scope of application and subject matter covered 242
         1. Scope of application 242
         2. Definition of trade secret holder and infringer 245
         3. Infringing goods 247
      III. Scope of protection: the assessment of misappropriation and lawful conducts 250
         1. Lawful acquisition, use and disclosure 250
         2. Types of infringing conduct 252
            a) Unlawful acquisition 253
            b) Unlawful use and disclosure 255
            c) Third party liability 256
            d) Import and export 258
         3. Exceptions 261
   IV. Enforcement 264
      1. General provisions 265
      2. Limitation period 266
      3. Preservation of confidentiality during litigation 267
      4. Remedies available in case of infringement 269
         a) Provisional and precautionary measures 269
         b) Injunctions and corrective measures 271
         c) Damages 273
         d) Publication of the judicial decision 274
         e) Claims for information and preserving evidence 275
§ 6 Conclusion 276

Chapter 4. Mapping the notion of secrecy 279
§ 1 Secrecy in the digital age 279
   A) Increasing vulnerability of confidential information 279
   B) Constructing the public domain 281
Different concepts and requirements for protection of trade secrets before the implementation of the TSD

A) Concept and requirements for the protection of trade secrets in Germany
   I. Distinction between Geschäftsgeheimnis and Betriebsgeheimnissen
   II. Requirements for the protection of trade secrets
       1. Information
       2. Information connected to a business — Geschäftsbezogenheit
       3. Secrecy — Nichtoffenkundigkeit
       4. Will to keep the information secret — Geheimhaltungswille
       5. Interest in keeping the information secret — Geheimhaltungsinteresse

B) The notion of confidentiality in England
   I. Concepts of confidential information and trade secret in England
   II. Subject matter capable of protection
       1. Commercial value: protection of trivial information?
       2. Information that is vague
       3. Immoral and false information
   III. Confidential nature of the information
       1. The general test of inaccessibility
       2. Form of the information
       3. No need to adopt reasonable measures

Section 3

Preliminary remarks
A) Terminology
B) Commercial value
C) Private and personal information
D) Adoption of reasonable steps
E) A requirement of identification of the information concerned?

Section 4

Deconstructing secrecy
A) Evaluating the degree of secrecy required
Table of Contents

B) The doctrine of ready ascertainability and the principle of inaccessibility 318
   I. Absence of a normative standard 318
   II. Criticism 321
C) Fencing secrecy by its negative dimension 324
   I. The “Third Party Doctrine” of trade secrets law and its limitations: conceptualising the different types disclosures 325
   II. Effects of the disclosure 328
      1. Disclosure in a patent application or specification 328
         a) England as an example case 328
         b) Guiding principles 329
      2. Disclosure to the state and its authorities 330
         a) England as an example case 330
         b) Confidentiality in the acquis communautaire and the right of access to documents 335
         c) Protection of competing interests in the TSD 337
         d) Guiding principles 338
      3. Marketing of a product in which the trade secret is embodied 339
         a) U.S. 340
         b) England 343
         c) Germany 345
         d) Guiding principles 346
   4. Disclosures on the Internet 349
      a) U.S. 349
      b) England 352
      c) Germany 353
      d) Guiding principles 354
   5. Limited content: combination secrets 358
      a) U.S. 360
      b) England 364
      c) Germany 365
      d) Guiding principles 368
   6. Disclosures in the Cloud 372
      a) General considerations and outline of the problem 372
      b) Guiding principles 375
D) The doctrine of relevant circles 378
   I. U.S. 379
   II. England 381
Table of Contents

III. Germany 382
IV. Guiding principles 384
E) Secrecy as opposed to IPRs normative standards 385
   I. Novelty 385
      1. Novelty under the EPC 385
      2. U.S. cases that demand novelty 388
         a) Analysis of the relevant case law 388
         b) The “law of ideas” 390
      3. English cases that demand novelty under the breach of confidence action 393
   II. Originality 394
      1. U.S. 395
      2. England 396
III. Conclusion – protection of abstract ideas 397
F) Excursus: Trade secrets and Big Data — the way forward? 400
   I. The Data Economy and the associated phenomena 401
   II. Assessing the possibility of relying on trade secrets protection for industrial data 408
      1. Reconciling the legal requirements of protection of trade secrets law with Big Data 409
      2. Additional problems: identifying the trade secret holder and the risk of infringement 413
      3. Conclusion on the applicability of the trade secrets liability regime to Big Data 414

§ 5 Conclusion 415

Chapter 5. Study case: the strategic importance of secrecy in the perfume industry 417

§ 1 Preliminary remarks on the methodology applied 417
§ 2 The perfume industry 418
§ 3 The protection of perfumes through IPRs 420
   A) Copyright 420
      I. Object of protection 420
      II. Requirements for protection 421
         1. Literary and artistic work 422
         2. Originality: author’s own intellectual creation 424
         3. Fixation 428
      III. Evaluation 430
B) Patent Law
   I. Object of protection
      1. Aromatic compounds
      2. Aromatic compositions
   II. Requirements for protection
   III. Evaluation

C) Trade mark law
   I. Object of protection
   II. Requirements for protection
      1. Signs
      2. Representation
      3. Distinctiveness
      4. Functionality
   III. Evaluation

D) Unfair competition – Comparative advertisement
   I. Object of protection
   II. Requirements for protection in the wake of L’Oréal v Bellure
      1. Two-step test: Definition of comparative advertisement and the appraisal of fairness
      2. Presentation of products as imitations in the wake of L’Oréal v Bellure
   III. Evaluation

§ 4 The role of trade secrets in the protection of perfumes
   A) Importance of trade secrets for the perfume industry
   B) Increasing vulnerability of trade secrets in the perfume sector
      I. Reverse engineering
      II. Demands for disclosure and transparency
      III. Electronic information storage and transmission
      IV. Employment mobility
      V. Measures adopted to protect the company’s trade secrets

§ 5 Conclusion

Chapter 6. The internal and external spheres of secrecy and their limitations
Table of Contents

II. Secrecy obligations of departing employees 471
   1. Employees general skills, knowledge and experience
      and the implied obligation of secrecy after the
      termination of the employment relationship 472
      a) Comparative law analysis 472
         aa) U.S. 472
         bb) England 478
         cc) Germany 480
      b) Implied secrecy obligation of departing employees
         under the TSD 484
      c) Guiding principles 486
   2. Some considerations regarding post contractual non-
      disclosure and non-competition clauses 489
      a) Comparative law analysis 490
         aa) U.S. 490
         bb) England 493
         cc) Germany 498
      b) Post-contractual obligations under the TSD 501

B) The external sphere of secrecy 502
   I. Licensing agreements 503
      1. Object and legal nature 503
      2. Secrecy obligations 506
         a) Pre-contractual obligations of secrecy 506
         b) During the term of the contract 507
            aa) Secrecy obligations of the licensor 507
            bb) Secrecy obligations of the licensee 508
         c) After the termination of the contract 510
   II. R&D agreements 511
      1. Object and legal nature 511
      2. Secrecy obligations 513

§ 2 The limitations of secrecy 515
   A) Independent discovery and creation 516
   B) Reverse engineering 518
      I. Conceptual introductory remarks 518
      II. Rationales underlying reverse engineering 521
      III. Comparative law analysis 525
         1. TRIPs 525
         2. U.S. 526
         3. England before the implementation of the TSD 529
         4. Germany before the implementation of the TSD 534
IV. Reverse engineering under the TSD
   1) Scope of the reverse engineering pursuant to Article 3(1)(b) TSD
   2) Contractual limitations on the possibility of reverse engineering and in particular the interplay with the Software Directive
   3) Guiding principles
   C) Competition law as an inherent limitation to the protection conferred by a trade secret

§ 3 The optimal scope of secrecy: a balanced approach in the light of the TSD
   A) The Nordhaus model and trade secrets protection
   B) Legal application of the Nordhaus model to trade secrets protection: introduction of a presumption regarding post-contractual duration in business-to-business relationships

Conclusion

Annex 1: Transcript of the Interview with head of IP Perfume Company 1

Annex 2: Transcript of the interview with Perfumist Rosendo Mateu

Zusammenfassung

Bibliography
### Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AIA</td>
<td>America Invents Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAG</td>
<td>Bundesarbeitsgericht or Federal Labour Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BC</td>
<td>Berne Convention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BGB</td>
<td>Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BGH</td>
<td>Bundesgerichtshof or Federal Supreme Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BKartA</td>
<td>Bundeskartellamt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BverGe</td>
<td>Bundesverfassungsgerichtsentcheidungen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCZ</td>
<td>Corporate Compliance Zeitschrift</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFI</td>
<td>Court of First Instance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ChFREU</td>
<td>Charter of Fundamental Rights of the EU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CJEU</td>
<td>Court of Justice of the European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commission</td>
<td>The European Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CR</td>
<td>Computer und Recht</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPMA</td>
<td>German Patent and Trade Mark Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSU</td>
<td>Dispute Settlement Understanding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DTSA</td>
<td>Defend Trade Secrets Act of 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.g. (from Latin exempli gratia)</td>
<td>For example</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC</td>
<td>European Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC Treaty</td>
<td>The Treaty Establishing the European Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECHR</td>
<td>European Convention of Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECJ</td>
<td>European Court of Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECR</td>
<td>European Court Reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECS</td>
<td>European Copyright Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECtHR</td>
<td>European Court of Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ed/eds</td>
<td>Editor/Editors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EIPR</td>
<td>European Intellectual Property Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EJIL</td>
<td>European Journal of International Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPC</td>
<td>European Patent Convention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPO</td>
<td>European Patent Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abbreviations

EUTMR European Union Trade Mark Regulation
FTC Federal Trade Commission
GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GCEU General Court of the European Union
GG Grundgesetz für die Bundesrepublik Deutschland
GRUR Gewerblicher Rechtsschutz und Urheberrecht
GRUR Int Gewerblicher Rechtsschutz und Urheberrecht/Internationaler Teil
HGB Handelsgesetzbuch
HRA Human Rights Act
i.e. (from Latin *id est*) That is to say
IDEA IDEA: The Intellectual Property Law Review
IIC International Review of Intellectual Property and Competition Law
IoT Internet of Things
IP Intellectual Property
IPQ Intellectual Property Quarterley
IPR(s) Intellectual Property Right(s)
JEP Journal of Economic Perspectives
JIPITEC Journal of Intellectual Property, Information Technology and Electronic Commerce Law
JIIPLP Journal of Intellectual Property Law and Practice
JuS Juristische Schulung
LJ Law Journal
LQR Law Quarterly Review
LR Law Review
MCAD Misleading and Comparative Advertisement Directive
NAFTA North American Free Trade Agreement
NDA Non-disclosure agreement
NZA Neue Zeitschrift für Arbeitsrecht
NZA-RR Neue Zeitschrift für Arbeitsrecht-Rechtsprechungs-Report Arbeitsrecht
para(s) Paragraph(s)
PC Paris Convention
R&D Research and Development
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>R&amp;DBER</td>
<td>Research and Development Block Exemption Regulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Supreme Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TEU</td>
<td>The Treaty of the European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TFEU</td>
<td>The Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TMD</td>
<td>Trade Mark Directive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TMR</td>
<td>Trade Mark Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRIPs</td>
<td>Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TSD</td>
<td>Trade Secrets Directive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TTBER</td>
<td>Technology Transfer Block Exemption Regulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>United States of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UTSA</td>
<td>Uniform Trade Secrets Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UWG</td>
<td>Gesetz gegen den unlauteren Wettbewerb</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VCLT</td>
<td>Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VPN</td>
<td>Virtual Private Networks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHO</td>
<td>World Health Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WIPO</td>
<td>World Intellectual Property Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WRP</td>
<td>Wettbewerb in Recht und Praxis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTO</td>
<td>World Trade Organisation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>