

Melanie Müller

Opposition Party Behavior and Minority Government Support

Challenges, Strategies and Trade-Offs



Nomos

Studien zum Parlamentarismus | 36

Series editors:

Prof. Dr. Werner J. Patzelt, Dresden

Prof. Dr. Suzanne S. Schüttemeyer, Halle/Berlin

Melanie Müller

Opposition Party Behavior and Minority Government Support

Challenges, Strategies and Trade-Offs



Nomos

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Kaiserslautern, TU, Diss., 2021

ISBN 978-3-8487-8473-8 (Print)
978-3-7489-2853-9 (ePDF)

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-8473-8 (Print)
978-3-7489-2853-9 (ePDF)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Müller, Melanie

Opposition Party Behavior and Minority Government Support
Challenges, Strategies and Trade-Offs

Melanie Müller

310 pp.

Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-8487-8473-8 (Print)
978-3-7489-2853-9 (ePDF)



Onlineversion
Nomos eLibrary

D386

1st Edition 2022

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2022. Overall responsibility for manufacturing (printing and production) lies with Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to "Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort", Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the author.

Thank you! Danke! Tack!

The fact that this dissertation was completed is, to a large extent, not my merit. Pursuing higher education in a country that cultivates social stagnation, its outbreak rarely results from an individual achievement but, as in my case, from the support of a multitude of people. First and foremost, I want to thank my parents, without whom I would not have successfully completed high school. Secondly, I would like to thank the Friedrich-Ebert foundation and the European Union, without whose ideational and financial support I would not have been able to study in Germany and Sweden. A special thanks goes to my supervisor Marcus, who contributed significantly to my interest in political science and offered me the freedom to pursue a Ph.D. Many thanks!

Stockholm, 24.10.2021

Table of Contents

List of Figures	11
List of Tables	15
1 Introduction	17
2 Explaining opposition party behavior and minority government support – a literature review	29
2.1 Literature on opposition behavior – a general review	30
2.2 The dilemma of opposition parties under minority governments	35
2.3 Theoretical expectations on opposition behavior and minority government support	39
2.3.1 Theoretical expectations in hypothesis block 1: Expectations about opposition party support regarding closeness to the minority government	40
2.3.2 Theoretical expectations in hypothesis block 2: Expectations about opposition party support on important issues	42
2.3.3 Theoretical expectations in hypothesis block 3: Expectations about strategic timing in opposition party support	47
2.3.4 Theoretical expectations in hypothesis block 4: Expectations about opposition party support regarding minority government size	50
2.3.5 Policy, Office, Votes: Assumptions on opposition party goals under minority government formation	51
2.3.5.1 Office-seeking opposition parties under minority government formation	52
2.3.5.2 Policy-seeking opposition parties under minority government formation	54
2.3.5.3 Votes-seeking opposition parties under minority government formation	55
2.3.5.4 Policy, Office, Votes: Gains and Trade-Offs	57
	7

Table of Contents

2.4	Expectations on opposition party behavior and minority government support – a brief summary	60
3	Data and method	66
3.1	Case selection: The Swedish political system	66
3.2	Investigation period	72
3.3	Mixed-methods-design	74
3.3.1	Quantitative method design	77
3.3.1.1	Data for quantitative analysis	77
3.3.1.2	Quantitative measures	80
3.3.1.2.1	Dependent variable: Minority government support by an opposition party	80
3.3.1.2.2	Independent variables: Hypothesis block 1	82
3.3.1.2.3	Independent variables: Hypothesis block 2	83
3.3.1.2.4	Independent variables: Hypothesis block 3	86
3.3.1.2.5	Independent variables: Hypothesis block 4	86
3.3.1.2.6	Control variables	87
3.3.1.3	Quantitative method	89
3.3.2	Qualitative method design	90
3.3.2.1	Data and method for qualitative analysis	90
3.3.2.2	Qualitative measures	93
4	Opposition party distinctiveness and minority government support – Patterns from quantitative analysis	98
4.1	Minority government support in parliamentary votes	98
4.2	Descriptive statistics of opposition party behavior	100
4.2.1	Descriptive statistics of hypothesis block 1: Closeness	100
4.2.2	Descriptive statistics of hypothesis block 2: Issue saliency	107
4.2.3	Descriptive statistics of hypothesis block 3: Timing	112
4.2.4	Descriptive statistics of hypothesis block 4: Minority government factors	121

4.3	Explaining opposition party behavior and minority government support: a quantitative analysis	124
4.3.1	Quantitative analysis of hypothesis block 1: Closeness	127
4.3.2	Quantitative analysis of hypothesis block 2: Issue saliency	134
4.3.3	Quantitative analysis of hypothesis block 3: Timing	139
4.3.4	Quantitative analysis of hypothesis block 4: Minority government factors	148
4.4	Robustness tests of the results of the quantitative analysis	152
4.4.1	Robustness tests of hypothesis block 1: Closeness	153
4.4.2	Robustness tests of hypothesis block 2: Issue saliency	155
4.4.3	Robustness tests of hypothesis block 3: Timing	158
4.4.4	Robustness tests of hypothesis block 4: Minority government factors	159
4.5	Opposition party strategies – between opposing and supporting minority governments. Summarizing results from quantitative analysis	160
5	Opposition party distinctiveness and minority government support – Patterns from qualitative analysis	166
5.1	Qualitative analysis of hypothesis block 1: Closeness	167
5.2	Qualitative analysis of hypothesis block 2: Issue saliency	172
5.3	Qualitative analysis of hypothesis block 3: Timing	177
5.4	Qualitative analysis of hypothesis block 4: Minority government factors	181
5.5	Hypotheses tests of the qualitative analysis: A brief summary	185
6	Opposition party distinctiveness and minority government support – Results from and limitations of a mixed-methods approach	190
7	Opposition party goals and conditions for cross-parliamentary cooperation	198
7.1	Cooperation types for majority formation	199
7.1.1	Cooperation type 1: Support agreement	199
7.1.2	Cooperation type 2: Issue agreement	200
7.1.3	Cooperation type 3: Short connections	200
7.1.4	Cooperation type 4: Information exchange	201

Table of Contents

7.1.5	Organizing parliamentary majorities under minority government: Summary of four types of cooperation	203
7.2	Opposition party types and strategies	205
7.2.1	Office-seeking opposition party type (1): The largest opposition party	206
7.2.2	Votes-seeking opposition party type: Smaller opposition parties that primarily strive to expand their electorate	209
7.2.3	Office-seeking opposition party type (2): Smaller opposition parties that strive for government offices	216
7.2.4	Policy-seeking opposition party type: Opposition parties willing to broadly cooperate	222
7.2.5	Changes in opposition parties' goals: a summary of the four types of opposition parties	228
7.3	Support agreement, cooperation, or conflict? A policy field analysis	232
7.4	Opposition party goals – between opposing and cooperating with a minority government. Summarizing results from qualitative analysis	239
8	Brief summary and discussion of results: Prospects and limitations	245
9	Conclusion: Opposition party behavior and minority government support	252
10	List of references	267
11	Annex	285
11.1	Regression tables of further model specifications	285
11.2	Regression tables of robustness analyses	289
11.2.1	Regression tables of Jackknife analyses	289
11.2.2	Regression tables of alternative and additional measures	294
11.3	Handbook of the Dataset ‚Parliamentary voting behavior under minority governments in the Swedish Riksdag 1991-2018’	308

List of Figures

Figure 1: Party Polarization in European countries in comparison	20
Figure 2: Government formation duration in European countries in comparison	21
Figure 3: The research design summarized	27
Figure 4: Opposition party behavior under minority government based on the theory of Policy, Office, Votes	59
Figure 5: Hypothesized effect directions of each hypothesis block	63
Figure 6: Assumptions on party goals and opposition party behavior	64
Figure 7: Investigation period quantitative analysis	73
Figure 8: Mixed-methods research design	77
Figure 9: Distribution of opposition votes	81
Figure 10: Agreement rate of opposition parties on committee proposals by legislative period	100
Figure 11: Agreement rate of opposition parties on committee proposals by ideological distance to the minority government	102
Figure 12: Agreement rate of ordinary opposition parties, support parties, and smaller coalition parties on committee proposals	103
Figure 13: Agreement rate of support parties on committee proposals by ideological distance to the minority government	105

List of Figures

Figure 14: Agreement rate of far-right opposition parties on committee proposals by minority government ideology	106
Figure 15: Agreement rate of opposition parties on committee proposals by the opposition party-specific issue saliency level	108
Figure 16: Agreement rate of opposition parties when voting on party-specific important issues per legislative period	111
Figure 17: Distribution of committee proposals over the legislative period and opposition party agreement rate under ten different times throughout the legislative period (average for all six governments)	113
Figure 18: Agreement rate of ordinary opposition parties and support parties under five different times throughout the legislative period (average for all six governments)	115
Figure 19: Agreement rate of ordinary opposition parties and support parties under ten different times throughout the legislative period (average for all six governments)	117
Figure 20: Agreement rate of ordinary opposition parties and support parties on committee proposals on five different timing points of each legislative period	118
Figure 21: Agreement rate of support parties under ten different times throughout the legislative period (average for all four governments) on important issues and non-important issues	120
Figure 22: Agreement rate of all opposition parties under different sized minority governments	123
Figure 23: Relationship between ideological distance and opposition party behavior and party status and party behavior	130
Figure 24: Relationship between ideological distance and opposition party behavior by a support agreement	131

Figure 25: Relationship between far-right opposition parties and opposition party behavior by ideological positioning of the government	133
Figure 26: Relationship between party issue saliency and support party support by ideological distance	137
Figure 27: Relationship between party issue saliency and parliamentary party support by ideological distance	138
Figure 28: Relationship between timing and opposition party behavior by support party	145
Figure 29: Relationship between timing and opposition party behavior by support party and important issues	146
Figure 30: Relationship between timing and opposition party behavior by support party and important issues (CMP running average coding)	148
Figure 31: Relationship between minority government size and opposition party behavior (substantive vs. formal)	151
Figure 32: Relationship between minority government size and opposition party behavior (support parties included and excluded)	152
Figure 33: Summarized results of the hypotheses tests of the quantitative analysis	164
Figure 34: Summarized results of the hypotheses tests of the qualitative analysis	189
Figure 35: Summarized results of the hypotheses tests of the quantitative and qualitative analysis	197
Figure 36: Type of cooperation by usage and its opposition party influence possibilities	204
Figure 37: Opposition party type by cooperation partners, party goals, and type of cooperation	231

List of Figures

Figure 38: Policy areas of cooperation and conflict by opposition parties	238
Figure 39: Research approach with summarized results	260

List of Tables

Table 1:	Expectations of strategic behavior by smaller coalition parties, support parties, and opposition parties	46
Table 2:	Assignment of policy fields to committees of the Swedish Riksdag to Comparative Manifesto Project variables	84
Table 3:	Assignment of the National SOM survey policy fields to committees of the Swedish Riksdag	89
Table 4:	Investigation period qualitative analysis	92
Table 5:	Correlation matrix of the independent variables	126
Table 6:	Results from logistic regression analyses for hypothesis block 1	128
Table 7:	Results from logistic regression analyses for hypothesis block 2	135
Table 8:	Results from logistic regression analyses for hypothesis block 3	141
Table 9:	Results from logistic regression analyses for hypothesis block 4	150
Table 10:	Alternative model specification; Multilevel Null Model	285
Table 11:	Alternative model specification; Multilevel Models with additional effects	286
Table 12:	Jackknife analysis; hypothesis block 1	289
Table 13:	Jackknife analysis; hypothesis block 2	291
Table 14:	Jackknife analysis; hypothesis block 3	292

List of Tables

Table 15:	Alternative and additional measures; hypothesis block 1	294
Table 16:	Alternative and additional measures; hypothesis block 1 (2)	296
Table 17:	Alternative measures; hypothesis block 2	297
Table 18:	Additional measures; hypothesis block 2	299
Table 19:	Alternative measures; hypothesis block 3	300
Table 20:	Additional measures; hypothesis block 3	303
Table 21:	Test of the effect of timing with different contrasts: conditional effects for support parties	305
Table 22:	Alternative and additional measures; hypothesis block 4	306