

Anna M. Lohmann

The Arbitrator's Discretion in Conflict of Laws Matters

Article 1(1) of the CISG in International Arbitration



Nomos

**Streitbeilegung und Streitvermeidung im Zivilrecht –
Schriftenreihe des Munich Center for Dispute Resolution**

**Edited by Beate Gsell, Wolfgang Hau and
Caroline Meller-Hannich**

Volume 10

Anna M. Lohmann

The Arbitrator's Discretion in Conflict of Laws Matters

Article 1(1) of the CISG in International Arbitration



Nomos

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: Münster, Univ., Diss., 2021

ISBN 978-3-8487-8476-9 (Print)
978-3-7489-2856-0 (ePDF)

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-8476-9 (Print)
978-3-7489-2856-0 (ePDF)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Lohmann, Anna M.

The Arbitrator's Discretion in Conflict of Laws Matters

Article 1(1) of the CISG in International Arbitration

Anna M. Lohmann

196 pp.

Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-8487-8476-9 (Print)
978-3-7489-2856-0 (ePDF)



Onlineversion
Nomos eLibrary

D 6

1st Edition 2022

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2022. Overall responsibility for manufacturing (printing and production) lies with Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to "Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort", Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the author.

I want to thank Prof. Dr. Gerald Mäsch and Prof. Dr. Bettina Heiderhoff, not only for being my supervisor and reviewers, but for planting a seed and encouraging me to tackle this project in the first place.

My wonderful parents Lynn and Ulrich, who I can always lean on and who provided endless supplies of love and counsel while I was working on this thesis. My mother, for elevating my writing through her patient proofreading.

Hugh Spitzer, who generously took the time to read a draft and gave valuable and kind feedback.

And finally, Johannes, who went above and beyond, gradually becoming an expert on the subject through countless late-night discussions, bringing structure into my thoughts and prodding me to think further and dig deeper.

Abbreviations

ABA J.	American Bar Association Journal
AEDIP	Anuario Español de Derecho internacional privado
Am. J. Comp. L.	American Journal of Comparative Law
Arb. Int.	Arbitration International
Asian Int'l Arb. J.	Asian International Arbitration Journal
B.U. Int'l L.	Boston University International Law Journal
BB	Betriebs-Berater
BTWR	Beiträge zum Transnationalen Wirtschaftsrecht
Chi. J. Int'l L.	Chicago Journal of International Law
Colum. J. Transnat'l L.	Columbia Journal of Transnational Law
Cornell Int'l L.J.	Cornell International Law Journal
ed.	edition, editor
ERCL	European Review of Contract Law
Eur. J. L. Reform	European Journal of Law Reform
FS	Festschrift
Int'l & Comp.L.Q.	International & Comparative Law Quarterly
IPRax	Praxis des Internationalen Privat- und Verfahrensrechts
J. Int'l Arb.	Journal of International Arbitration
J.I.D.S.	Journal of International Dispute Settlement
J. Priv. Int.	Journal of Private International Law
JZ	JuristenZeitung
Law & Pol'y Int'l Bus.	Law and Policy in International Business
Mich. J. Int'l L.	Michigan Journal of International Law
NYC	New York Convention
p.	page
para.	paragraph
RabelsZ	Rabels Zeitschrift für ausländisches und internationales Privatrecht
RdC	Recueil des Cours
RHDI	Revue Hellenique de Droit International
RIW	Recht der Internationalen Wirtschaft

Abbreviations

Savigny-Zeitschrift	Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechtsgeschichte
SchiedsVZ	Zeitschrift für Schiedsverfahren
Sec.	Section
U. Toronto L.J.	University of Toronto Law Journal
Unif. L. Rev.	Uniform Law Review
WAMR	World Arbitration & Mediation Review
Yale L.J.	Yale Law Journal

Table of Contents

Introduction	15
I. Object of Inquiry	16
II. Steps of Inquiry	19
§ 1. The CISG and International Commercial Arbitration	20
A. The CISG	20
I. History	20
1. ULF and ULIS	21
2. CISG	23
II. Nature	25
a) Part of Domestic Legal Systems	26
b) Independence from Domestic Legal System	27
B. The CISG in International Commercial Arbitration	29
I. Compatibility of the CISG and International Commercial Arbitration	29
II. Application by International Arbitration Tribunals	30
§ 2. Article 1(1) CISG – Rules of Application	33
A. Overview over the Provision	33
I. Connections with Contracting States	34
II. Further Requirements of Applicability	35
1. Internationality	35
2. Sale of Goods	36
B. Legal Nature	37
I. Structure and Function of Conflict of Laws Rules	38
1. Function	38
2. Structure	40
II. Article 1(1)(a) of the CISG	43
1. Structure	43
2. Function	45
a) Conflict of Laws Analysis Not Superfluous	45
b) Alternatives Test	47

Table of Contents

III. Article 1(1)(b) of the CISG	49
1. Ambiguous Wording	50
2. Systematic Interpretation	52
a) <i>Renvois</i> Within “the Rules of Private International Law”	52
b) Effect of Article 95 Reservation	54
c) Law Applicable to Opt-Out	58
aa) Choice of Law	58
bb) Applicable Law	61
d) CISG Applicable as Domestic Law	64
3. Conclusion	66
IV. Consequences for Article 1(1) of the CISG as a Whole	67
1. Structure	67
a) Alternative Connecting Factors	67
b) Unilaterality	68
2. Effect	71
C. Conclusion	72
§ 3. Binding Effect of Article 1(1) in International Commercial Arbitration	73
A. Legal Framework of Arbitration Proceedings	75
I. Overview over Potentially Applicable Laws and Rules	75
1. Institutional Rules	75
2. The Arbitral Seat and the <i>Lex Loci Arbitri</i>	76
3. Recognition and Enforcement of Arbitration Awards	78
II. The Localization Debate	79
1. Localization	80
2. Delocalization	81
3. Discussion	83
B. Competence to Make Conflict Rules Applicable in International Commercial Arbitration	85
I. Legislative Jurisdiction	86
1. The Lotus Decision	86
2. Genuine Link	87
3. Treaty or Customary Law	89
II. Arbitral Tribunals as “Quasi-Courts” of a State	91
1. Theories Regarding the Nature of Arbitration	92
2. Discussion	93
a) Source of Power	94

b) Application of Law	98
aa) No Maintenance of the Law	98
bb) Application of Non-State Law or No Law	101
c) The Arbitral Award	103
3. Conclusion	106
III. Seat of Arbitration as Genuine Link	107
1. Territoriality	107
2. Party Choice	109
3. Conclusion	113
IV. Customary Law Basis for Arbitration-Specific Conflict Rule	113
1. State Practice	113
2. <i>Opinio Iuris</i>	116
a) New York Convention	117
b) <i>Travaux Préparatoires</i> of the UNCITRAL Model Law	119
3. Conclusion	121
V. Conclusion	121
C. Inapplicability of the Rome I Regulation in International Commercial Arbitration	122
I. No Intention of Application by Drafters	123
1. Exception Regarding “Arbitration Agreements”	123
2. Reference to “Court or Tribunal”	125
3. <i>Travaux Préparatoires</i> of the Rome Convention	127
II. Incompatibility with International Arbitration	128
1. Party Autonomy: Limitations to the Choice of Law	129
a) Choice of Conflict Rule	131
b) Choice of Non-State Law	131
c) Decisions <i>Ex Aequo et Bono</i>	133
2. Superfluous Protections for Weaker Parties	134
a) Consumer Protection	134
aa) ECJ Decisions	135
bb) Specialized Arbitration Procedures	137
b) Employee Protection	139
3. Incongruent System of Public Policy and Overriding Mandatory Rules	140
a) Public Policy	141
b) Overriding Mandatory Provisions	143
4. Forum Shopping	147
III. Conclusion	148

Table of Contents

D. Practical Freedom of Arbitrators to Determine Substantive Law	148
I. Methods Applied in Arbitral Practice	148
1. Voie Indirecte	149
a) Choice of Conflict of Laws Rules of a State	149
b) Cumulative Method	150
c) General Principles of Private International Law	151
2. Voie Directe	151
II. No Reviewability of Application of Private International Law	153
1. Review of Arbitral Awards	153
2. Individual Grounds for Annulment and Refusal of Recognition and Enforcement	155
a) Excess of Authority	155
b) Procedure	156
c) Public Policy	158
3. Conclusion	161
E. Application of the CISG as Non-State Law	161
F. Conclusion	164
§ 4. Application of Substantive Provisions of the CISG in International Commercial Arbitration	166
A. Binding Effect of Substantive Law Dependent on Party Choice	167
I. Historical Application of Law in Arbitration	167
II. Arbitration-Specific Modes of Decision	169
1. <i>Ex Aequo et Bono</i> and <i>Amiables Compositeurs</i>	170
2. Application of Non-State Law	171
3. Influence of Trade Usages	172
III. Decisions Based on Law	173
B. Reviewability	174
I. Reviewability of Substantive Law Application	175
1. Public Policy Violation	175
2. <i>Effet Utile</i> of European Law	176
II. Reviewability of Type of Decision	179
1. Procedural Mistake	179
2. Excess of Authority	181
3. Public Policy	182
III. Conclusion	183
C. Consequences for the Application of the CISG	183

Table of Contents

Conclusion	185
Bibliography	187

