

RELIGION IN DER GESELLSCHAFT

Mohammad Magout

# A Reflexive Islamic Modernity

Academic Knowledge and  
Religious Subjectivity in the  
Global Ismaili Community



Ergon

Mohammad Magout

# A Reflexive Islamic Modernity

# RELIGION IN DER GESELLSCHAFT

Herausgegeben von

Matthias Koenig, Volkhard Krech, Martin Laube,  
Detlef Pollack, Hartmann Tyrell, Gerhard Wegner,  
Monika Wohlrab-Sahr

Band 47

---

ERGON VERLAG

Mohammad Magout

# A Reflexive Islamic Modernity

Academic Knowledge and  
Religious Subjectivity in the  
Global Ismaili Community

---

ERGON VERLAG

Umschlagabbildung:  
Wisam Elhamoui, <https://www.mosaicboards.com>

Bibliografische Information der Deutschen Nationalbibliothek  
Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in der  
Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind  
im Internet über <http://dnb.d-nb.de> abrufbar.

© Ergon – ein Verlag in der Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden 2020  
Das Werk einschließlich aller seiner Teile ist urheberrechtlich geschützt.  
Jede Verwertung außerhalb des Urheberrechtsgesetzes bedarf der Zustimmung des Verlages.  
Das gilt insbesondere für Vervielfältigungen jeder Art, Übersetzungen, Mikroverfilmungen  
und für Einspeicherungen in elektronische Systeme.  
Gedruckt auf alterungsbeständigem Papier.  
Umschlaggestaltung: Jan von Hugo

[www.ergon-verlag.de](http://www.ergon-verlag.de)

ISBN 978-3-95650-636-9 (Print)

ISBN 978-3-95650-637-6 (ePDF)

ISSN 1432-0304

## Acknowledgements

The journey to realize this book has been long and sometimes marred by difficulties and challenges, which could not have been overcome without the generous support of several people.

The first word of thanks goes to Prof. Dr. Verena Klemm, who supervised my PhD dissertation, on which this book is based. She read through several manuscripts of each individual chapter and provided valuable feedback on their contents. I am, furthermore, grateful to faculty members, fellows, and administrators of the Research Training Group “Religious Non-conformism and Cultural Dynamics” at the University of Leipzig, who created an environment that is conducive to scientific exchange and social interaction. In particular, I would like to thank the Speaker of the Group, Prof. Dr. em. Hubert Seiwert, and my mentor, Prof. Dr. Adam Jones, for their extensive support and encouragement. In addition, the Research Coordinators of the Group—Judith Zimmermann, Anke Költch, Markus Klank, and Marion von Roth—were all very attentive to my endless needs as a foreign student in Germany.

Being a PhD student is no easy matter, especially when one is in a foreign country away from family and friends. Since it took me a while to learn German, sport was often the only activity where I could communicate with other people without the need for words. I am therefore grateful to my Taekwondo trainer Johannes Wiggering as well as my fitness trainer Kenny Höber, in whose courses I found the psychological and social outlet I desperately needed over these years.

Upon finishing my PhD studies, I joined the Humanities Centre for Advanced Studies “Multiple Secularities - Beyond the West, Beyond Modernities” at the University of Leipzig, where I found another supportive environment that nurtured my development as an early-career researcher. I am thankful to all its members, fellows, administrators, and student assistants for the lovely moments and stimulating exchanges I have had with them. In particular, I am deeply indebted to Prof. Dr. Monika Wohlrab-Sahr, the co-Director of the center, Judith Zimmermann, the Research Coordinator, and PD. Dr. Markus Dressler, Senior Researcher, who provided me with their generous support—whether academic, administrative, or personal—whenever I needed it.

Furthermore, I am thankful to the staff at Ergon Verlag and the editors of the *Religion in der Gesellschaft* series for their efforts in bringing this book to light.

At a personal level, I have been blessed with the friendship of many individuals—many more than I can name here—who have supported or inspired me in numerous ways over this long journey. I am thankful above all to Joud, Manal, Mustafa, Terez, and Wisam for adding color, music, and joy into my life. Additionally, due thanks should be given, albeit anonymously, to the person who inspired me to start this research project in the first place.

Last but not least, the greatest words of thanks go to my parents. The passion for knowledge and education they instilled in me at a young age was the power that has driven me to carry out this research project and bring it to a conclusion with the publication of this book.

Mohammad Magout  
Leipzig, January 2020

## *Table of Contents*

Note on Transliteration .....	11
List of Abbreviations .....	13
CHAPTER ONE – Introduction .....	15
1. Development and Conceptualization .....	17
2. Objectives and Relevance .....	20
3. Outline of the Book .....	23
CHAPTER TWO – Theoretical Framework and Literature Review .....	29
1. The Theory of Reflexive Modernity .....	29
1.1. A Response to Postmodern Theory .....	29
1.2. Defining Reflexivity .....	30
1.3. Boundaries and Subjectivity in First vs. Late Modernity .....	31
1.4. Community and Shared Meanings in Late Modernity .....	33
1.5. Social Sciences and Modernity .....	34
1.6. Relevance for this Study .....	35
2. Primary Concepts .....	36
2.1. Religion .....	36
2.2. Knowledge and Belief .....	37
2.3. Faith and Reason .....	40
2.4. Culture .....	42
3. Religion in the Modern World .....	45
3.1. Revisiting the Secularization Thesis .....	46
3.2. Secularism and the Secular – The Epistemic Dimension .....	48
3.3. The Debate about Religion in the Public Sphere .....	50
3.4. Religion, Science, and Higher Education .....	53
CHAPTER THREE – Research Methodology .....	57
1. Analysis of Ismaili Academic Discourse on Religion .....	57
1.1. Promotional Materials and Institutional Documents .....	58
1.2. Articles .....	59
1.3. Speeches, Lectures, and Other Public Events .....	60
1.4. Selected Speeches of the Aga Khan .....	61



2. Ethnographic Investigation of Ismaili Students in London .....	61
2.1. Ontological and Epistemological Basis .....	61
2.2. Research Design .....	63
2.3. Reflexivity in Ethnographic Research .....	64
2.3.1. Insider vs. Outsider Research .....	65
2.3.2. The Ismaili Community and Academic Research .....	67
2.3.3. Personal Experience of Researching Ismailis .....	70
3. Methods of Data Collection .....	71
3.1. Interviews .....	71
3.1.1. Sample .....	72
3.1.2. Sampling Methods .....	74
3.1.3. Outline and Questions .....	75
3.2. Participant Observation .....	78
3.3. Meetings with Experts .....	79
4. Analysis .....	80
5. Ethical Issues .....	82
CHAPTER FOUR – Ismailism: An Overview .....	85
1. From Beginnings to the Fall of Alamut (765 – 1256) .....	85
1.1. Historical Overview .....	85
1.2. Doctrines and Thought .....	87
1.2.1. Early Ismaili Thought .....	87
1.2.2. Fatimid Ismaili Thought .....	88
1.2.3. Ismaili Thought during the Alamut Era .....	90
1.3. Organization .....	91
2. Post-Alamut Ismailism (1256 – 1817) .....	93
3. Modern Ismailism (1817 – Present) .....	96
3.1. Aga Khan I: From Qajar Iran to British India .....	96
3.2. Aga Khan III: The Modernization of Ismailism .....	98
3.3. Aga Khan IV: From Modernization to Globalization .....	100
4. Ismailism, Islam, and the West .....	104
4.1. The Heterogeneity of Contemporary Ismailism .....	104
4.2. Relationship to Mainstream Islam .....	109
4.3. Relationship to the West .....	110

CHAPTER FIVE – The IIS and the ISMC: Origins, Structure, and Discourse .....	113
1. Education in Ismailism: An Overview .....	113
1.1. The Classical Period .....	113
1.2. Contemporary Ismailism .....	115
2. Ismaili Academic Institutions in London .....	118
2.1. IIS .....	118
2.2. ISMC .....	120
2.3. Programs .....	122
2.3.1. Curriculum and Structure .....	123
2.4. The IIS and the ISMC in the Context of Higher Education and Religion .....	126
3. Ismaili Public Discourse on Religion .....	128
3.1. What are Ismailis Responding to? .....	128
3.1.1. Critiquing Secularism .....	129
3.1.2. Critiquing Fundamentalism .....	131
3.2. Reconceptualizing Culture and Religion .....	132
3.2.1. Culture as a Mediating Concept .....	132
3.2.2. Culture as a Medium to Deconstruct Fundamentalist Conceptions .....	135
3.3. From Islam to Muslims .....	137
3.4. From Islamic to Inter-Disciplinarily Studies .....	139
4. Cultural Discourse within the Ismaili Community .....	141
4.1. Harmony through Culture .....	141
4.2. Culturalizing Theology or Theologizing Culture? .....	144
CHAPTER SIX – The Students: Social Interaction, Academic Knowledge, and Religious Belief .....	147
1. Social Interaction .....	147
1.1. Expectations of Similarity, Encounters with Heterogeneity .....	147
1.2. A Compact Social Environment: Living in a “Bubble” .....	150
1.3. Interaction with the Ismaili Community in London .....	153
1.3.1. Ritual Differences .....	153
1.3.2. Ethnic and Social Distinctions .....	155
1.3.3. Multiple Differentiations of the Religious and the Secular .....	158
1.3.4. Khojas’ View of other Ismailis .....	166
1.4. Summary of Section 1 .....	169

2. Academic Knowledge and Religious Belief .....	169
2.1. Epistemically Challenged .....	169
2.1.1. The Challenge of Defining Relationship to Mainstream Islam .....	170
2.1.2. Religiously ‘Introverted’ .....	172
2.2. Narratives of Doubt and Internal Struggles .....	176
2.3. Strategies and Approaches to Overcome Cognitive Dissonance .....	180
2.3.1. Normalization of Doubt .....	181
2.3.2. A Separatist Approach to Faith and Reason .....	183
2.3.3. Focus on Social and Psychological Functions of Religion .....	185
2.3.4. Drawing on Ismaili Doctrines .....	187
2.3.5. Deconstructing Questions and Normative Presumptions .....	188
2.3.6. Some Remarks about the Strategies .....	193
2.4. Summary of Section 2 .....	194
 CHAPTER SEVEN – The Three-Dimensional Challenge and the Shift to Reflexive Modernity .....	 195
1. The Three-Dimensional Challenge .....	195
2. Ismailism and Reflexive Modernity .....	200
3. Future Research .....	206
 Appendix I – Details of Quoted Interviews .....	 211
 Appendix II – Details of Quoted Fieldnotes .....	 213
 Appendix III – Sources for the Analysis of Ismaili Discourse on Religion .....	 215
 Bibliography .....	 219

## Note on Transliteration

Arabic and Persian terms in this book are transliterated according to the guidelines of the *International Journal of Middle Eastern Studies* (IJMES). Exempted from this rule are anglicized terms from the religious vernacular of contemporary Ismailism, which are written as they appear in *The Constitution of the Shia Imami Ismaili Muslims* or other official Ismaili documents in English. Notes explaining their etymologies and meanings are provided where appropriate.



## List of Abbreviations

<b>AKDN</b>	Aga Khan Development Network
<b>AKU</b>	Aga Khan University
<b>GPISH</b>	Graduate Programme in Islamic Studies and Humanities
<b>IIS</b>	The Institute of Ismaili Studies
<b>IoE</b>	Institute of Education, University of London
<b>ISMC</b>	Institute for the Study of Muslim Civilisations, Aga Khan University
<b>ITREB</b>	International Tariqah and Religious Education Board
<b>JK</b>	<i>Jamatkhana</i>
<b>STEP</b>	Secondary Teacher Education Programme

